



Date: May 11, 2016
To: Anna Pendergrass, Director
From: Leslie Chapman, Human Resources Manager
Cc: Kris DeVore, Operations Division Manager
CALEA Yearly Review / PowerDMS

Re: **Review of Complaint File for the Year 2015**

Per CALEA Standard 1.4.11 and CRESA Written Directive 01.009, I reviewed all internal investigations of formal complaints filed with CRESA during 2015.

The purpose of this report is to identify any trends in conduct or performance to mitigate before they cause additional similar problems or expose the Agency and its users to preventable liability or risk. Trends will be reviewed to ensure that personnel provide professional service, that personnel are well trained, and that internal investigations are timely, fair and impartial.

General Overview

Out of 405,934 total incoming calls received by 9-1-1 Operations in 2015, nine complaints were filed resulting in investigations. All of the nine complaints pertained to 9-1-1 Operations Division services and/or personnel.

The number of complaints compared to calls per year continues to show a very low ratio of complaints to calls:

<i>Year</i>	<i>Total Complaints / Concerns</i>	<i>Total Calls</i>	<i>Ratio: Complaints to Calls</i>
2015	3	405,934	1 : 135,133
2014	9	384,160	1 : 42,684
2013	10	375,458	1 : 37,546
2012	9	380,654	1 : 42,295
2011	23	377,412	1 : 16,409
2010	17	378,718	1 : 22,278

Of the 3 complaints filed in 2015, the origination is as follows:

- 3 filed by CRESA Employees (100%)

The 3 complaints involved allegations which resulted in the following investigation findings:

- 3 (100%) **Substantiated** Alleged action / behavior DID occur

Analysis:

- 2015's total complaints were lower than the average 13.6 complaints for the prior 5 years.
- 100% of 2015 complaints were substantiated; higher than the average over the prior 5 years.
- 2015 zero complaints were generated by Law Agencies which was significantly lower than the average 21% of complaints by Law of all complaints in the past 5 years.
- 2015 and 2014 had zero complaints generated by Fire Agency which is overall lower than the previous years' 24% average.





- 2015 zero complaints were generated by Citizens or individuals representing Business demonstrates a continual decline from 2014 complaints of 22% of 2014 complaints were generated by Citizens; lower than the average 32% Citizen / Business complaints averaged in the past 5 years.
- 100% of 2015 complaints were initiated by CRESA staff, the percentage is higher than the average in the past 5 years however the actual number is not.

Complaint Results Overview

The 3 complaints included:

- 3 (100%) *Conduct, Fail to follow internal (non-ops) policies*

Of the Substantiated Allegations:

- 3 allegations were substantiated due to employee error or judgment (*issues relating to "Person"*)
 - 0 were caused by Employee Performance - failure to follow operational procedure
 - 0 were caused by Employee Performance – failure to follow operations procedure with result of Delay in Service or No Service
 - 0 were caused by Employee Performance – inaccuracy in work
 - 3 were caused by Employee Conduct – failure to follow Personnel or Conduct Policies

Unsubstantiated Complaints / Indeterminate Complaints

- N/A

Substantiated Complaints

Analysis:

- 3 (100%) of 2015 substantiated allegations dealt with employee conduct issues, particular to internal policies and procedures not directly related to dispatch operations.

Unsubstantiated and Exonerated Complaints

Analysis and Summary:

- N/A





Complaint Investigation and Processing

<u>Investigator</u>	<u># of Complaints Investigated</u>	<u>Findings</u>	<u>Timeframe to Complete</u>
Supervisor Janie Chaney	1 complaint	Substantiated	1 complaint completed within 30 days.
Supervisor John Gaylord	3 complaints	2 Substantiated, 1 Unsubstantiated	1 complaint completed within 30 days. The 2 other complaints were investigated within 30 days each, but were related to other performance improvement measures and final disposition was not concluded within 30 days per incident.
Supervisor Jodi Gaylord	0 complaints		
Supervisor Andrew Walker	0 complaints		
Supervisor Lynn Walker	0 complaints		
Ops Mgr Katy Myers	4 complaints	2 Substantiated, 2 Unsubstantiated	2 complaints completed within 30 days. 2 complaints required a longer time to investigate (interview employees, gather information, etc.) and were not concluded within 30 days

Analysis and Summary:

- 5 investigations (56%) were completed within the required 30 day timeframe.
- 9 complaints involved employees working in the 9-1-1 Dispatch Operations Division. A total of 58 individuals worked in this division during 2014 as Dispatchers, Dispatcher Trainees working on the dispatch floor with a Communication Training Officer (CTO) or as Dispatch Supervisors.

The following is the breakdown of the number of complaints filed regarding CRESA 9-1-1 Operations staff:

- 46 of 58 employees (79%) had zero complaints filed about them.
- 11 of 58 employees (19%) had 1 complaint filed about them.
- 1 of 58 employees (2%) had 2 complaints filed about them.
- 0 of 58 employees (0%) had 3+ complaints filed about them.





- Dispatch complaint investigators were assigned by the Operations Manager primarily based on the Supervisor / Employee relationship. Complaint findings and conclusions were deduced from written CAD data, call recordings, radio recordings, employee interviews and/or complainant interviews.
- 0 of 9 complaints involved employees working in CRESA's other divisions programs. A total of 25 individuals worked in these 25 positions / FTEs during 2014. The following breakdowns the complaints:
- 25 of 25 Admin employees had zero complaints filed about them.

Trends or Patterns Discovered and Recommended Corrective Actions

Analysis:

- Corrective actions for 2014's substantiated complaints are very similar to the past 5 years' trends
- Appropriate corrective actions were determined by review of all relevant data, including employee's prior actions and/or complaints; time in the position; mitigating circumstances pertaining directly to the call; etc.
- Training / Coaching – Training, coaching and reviewing proper procedures and protocol remains the most commonly used correction. It is used in conjunction with all other levels of corrective action for substantiated complaints: including Oral Counseling, Oral Warning, and Written Warning or higher.
- Training, coaching and reviewing proper procedures and protocol is also widely used as a refresher tool for performance trends or patterns noted throughout the work year by supervisors.
- 2 of the 9 complaints were addressed using Coaching or Oral Counseling.
- 2 of the 9 complaints were addressed using Oral Warning.
- 1 of the 9 complaints was addressed using Written Warnings.
- Corrective actions higher than Written Warnings (e.g. Suspensions, Demotions, etc.) were not used for any substantiated complaints in 2014.
- Complaint Investigators recommend corrective action in their report and conclusions. These recommendations are reviewed and approved by the Operations Manager (for Dispatch complaints) and the Director for all complaints prior to corrective action being delivered.
- Investigators followed due process regarding employee notification of complaints, investigation and delivery of corrective action as necessary.
- Where there might have been significant corrective action such as suspension or termination, CRESA would have also notified the Washington Cities Insurance Authority (WCIA) for review and input prior to delivering corrective action. There were four instances where this was the case in 2014.

Summary: Investigators conducted the 2014 investigations in a professional manner. Four complaints came to the attention of CRESA management through external complainants. Five complaints came to the attention of CRESA management from an employee. There is no indication that the investigation of complaints is being done in a manner to target an employee. Employees received coaching and/or corrective action appropriate for the nature and severity of the complaints.

Complaint Review and Reporting

- This review of 2014 Complaint Investigations will be reported to the Agency Director and included in the Agency Annual Report, which will be provided to the CRESA Administrative Board and CRESA employees.





CLARK REGIONAL
EMERGENCY SERVICES AGENCY
Always here, always ready.

710 W. 13th Street
Vancouver, WA 98660
(360) 737 - 1911
cresa911.org

-
- A copy of this review will be filed with the 2014 Complaint Investigations.
 - A copy of this review will be included in the 2014 CALEA file for CALEA Standard 1.4.11.



For alternative formats: ADA OFFICE VOICE (360) 737-1911 FAX (360) 694-1954 RELAY 7-1-1 or 800-833-6388
cresa@clark.wa.gov cresa911.org